

Representing Immigrant Defendants in New York Sixth Edition

Manuel D. Vargas

Senior Counsel
Immigrant Defense Project

Immigrant Defense Project

Alisa Wellek, Executive Director

Mizue Aizeki, Deputy Director

Benita Jain, Managing Attorney

Marie Mark, Supervising Attorney, Padilla Support Center

Michelle Parris, Staff Attorney, Training and Resources Director

40 West 39th St., Fifth Floor

New York, NY 10018

212-725-6422

www.immdefense.org

This edition of this publication was supported in part by a grant from the Ford Foundation

© 2017 by the Immigrant Defense Project
and Manuel D. Vargas

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	<i>xii</i>
Preface	<i>xiii</i>
Acknowledgments	<i>xiv</i>
About the Author	<i>xv</i>
About the Immigrant Defense Project	<i>xvi</i>
How To Use This Manual	<i>xvii</i>
Where To Get Help	<i>xix</i>
List of Figures	<i>xxi</i>
List of Abbreviations	<i>xxii</i>

CHAPTER 1

REASONS TO CONSIDER THE IMMIGRATION CONSEQUENCES OF A CLIENT'S CASE

1.1	The Constitutional Duty of Defense Counsel Under <i>Padilla v. Kentucky</i> to Provide Effective Assistance Regarding the Immigration Consequences of a Criminal Case	3
1.2	The Risk That A Criminal Disposition Will Trigger Your Noncitizen Client's Removal From The United States Based on Deportability or Inadmissibility	4
1.2.A	Deportability v. Inadmissibility	4
1.2.B	What criminal dispositions trigger deportability?	5
1.2.C	What criminal dispositions trigger inadmissibility?	5
1.2.D	When do you need to be concerned that the criminal disposition may also eliminate a possibility of relief from deportability or inadmissibility?	6
1.2.E	What will happen if the criminal disposition triggers deportability or inadmissibility?	6
1.2.F	What are the long-term effects of a removal order for your noncitizen client?	6
1.3	The Risk That A Criminal Disposition Will Bar Your Lawful Permanent Resident Client From U.S. Citizenship	7
1.4	The Professional Duty To Investigate and Advise Your Noncitizen Client Regarding the Immigration Consequences of a Criminal Case	7
1.4.A	Duty to inquire about citizenship/immigration status at initial interview stage	8
1.4.B	Duty to investigate and advise about immigration consequences of plea alternatives	9
1.4.C	Duty to investigate and advise about immigration consequences of sentencing alternatives	9
1.5	The Critical Difference That You As a Criminal Defense Lawyer Can Make For Your Noncitizen Client	9

CHAPTER
2

DETERMINING YOUR CRIMINAL DEFENDANT CLIENT'S CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION STATUS

2.1 Why You Should Carefully Determine The Citizenship And Immigration Status Of Each New Client. 17

2.2 Is Your Client A Noncitizen? 17

2.2.A Samples of common documentation of U.S. citizenship status. 18

2.2.B Charts for determining citizenship of children born abroad to parents who were or later became U.S. citizens 20

2.3 If Your Client Is A Noncitizen, What Is Your Client's Particular Immigration Status? 33

2.3.A Lawful permanent resident status and samples of common documentation of such status. 33

2.3.B Refugee or asylee status and samples of common documentation of such status 39

2.3.C Client is a noncitizen who only has some temporary or indefinite status or is undocumented, but might be eligible in the future to obtain lawful permanent resident or asylee status or other protection from removal 43

2.3.D Client does not fall into any of the above categories. 43

CHAPTER
3

POSSIBLE IMMIGRATION CONSEQUENCES OF A NONCITIZEN CRIMINAL DEFENDANT CLIENT'S CASE

3.1 Potential Immigration Consequences Depend On Your Client's Immigration Status. 47

3.2 Your Client Is A Lawful Permanent Resident. 47

3.2.A The client and a suggested approach to the case: Focus on avoiding deportability and inadmissibility 47

3.2.B Criminal dispositions that make a lawful permanent resident subject to removal based on deportability. 48

3.2.B(1) Aggravated felony. 48

3.2.B(2) Crime(s) involving moral turpitude. 48

3.2.B(3) Controlled substance offense. 48

3.2.B(4) Firearm offense. 49

3.2.B(5) Crime of domestic violence, stalking, crime against children, or violation of protection order. 49

3.2.B(6) Offenses that do not require conviction. 49

3.2.C Criminal dispositions that make a lawful permanent resident subject to removal based on inadmissibility 49

3.2.D Relief from removal that may be available to a lawful permanent resident, and criminal dispositions to avoid to preserve relief possibility. 49

3.2.D(1) Cancellation of removal. 49

3.2.D(2) Waiver of criminal inadmissibility. 50

3.2.D(3) Withholding of removal. 50

3.2.E	Additional issues to consider if your client avoids removal.	51
3.2.E(1)	Inability to travel outside the United States.	51
3.2.E(2)	Ineligibility for U.S. citizenship.	51
3.3	Your Client Is A Refugee Or A Person Granted Asylum (Who Has Not Yet Obtained Lawful Permanent Resident Status).	51
3.3.A	The client and a suggested approach to the case: Focus on avoiding inadmissibility.	51
3.3.B	Criminal dispositions that make a person admitted as a refugee subject to removal.	52
3.3.C	Criminal dispositions that make a person granted asylum subject to removal.	53
3.3.D	Relief from removal that may be available to your refugee or asylee client and criminal dispositions to avoid to preserve relief possibility.	53
3.4	Your Client Only Has Some Temporary or Indefinite Status Or Is Undocumented, But Might Be Eligible In The Future To Obtain Lawful Permanent Resident Or Asylee Status Or Other Protection From Removal.	54
3.4.A	The client and a suggested approach to the case.	54
3.4.B	Preserving a client's possible eligibility for lawful permanent resident status	55
3.4.C	Preserving a client's possible eligibility for asylum or other relief from removal to a country where the client may suffer persecution or which is experiencing civil strife or disaster	58
3.5	Your Client Is A Noncitizen Who Does Not Fall Into Any Of The Above Categories Or Who Does But Will Be Unable To Avoid Removal: Additional Issues To Consider	60
3.5.A	Ineligibility for readmission to the United States after removal or voluntary departure	61
3.5.B	Ineligibility for voluntary departure in lieu of removal	61
3.5.C	Ineligibility for early release from prison for removal.	62
3.5.D	Enhanced liability for illegal reentry after removal	62

CHAPTER
4

ANALYZING NEW YORK DISPOSITIONS UNDER FEDERAL IMMIGRATION LAW

4.1	What Is A "Conviction" Under Immigration Law?	71
4.1.A	Juvenile delinquency adjudication	72
4.1.B	Juvenile offender disposition	73
4.1.C	Youthful offender adjudication	73
4.1.D	Adjournment in contemplation of dismissal.	74
4.1.E	Violation or traffic infraction	75
4.1.F	Drug treatment diversion.	76
4.1.G	Certificate of relief from civil disabilities	77
4.1.H	Plea of not responsible by reason of mental disease or defect	78
4.1.I	Conviction on appeal	78
4.1.J	Vacated conviction.	79

4.2	What Is A Sentence To A “Term Of Imprisonment” Under Immigration Law?	79
4.2.A	Indeterminate sentence of imprisonment	80
4.2.B	Probation, conditional discharge, or unconditional discharge	80
4.2.C	Commitment to a mental institution or youth facility	81
4.3	Immigration Consequences of Broadly Defined State Offenses — The Categorical Approach and Divisibility Analysis	81
4.3.A	The categorical approach	81
4.3.B	The modified categorical approach — Divisible statutes and the record of conviction	82
4.3.B(1)	Identifying a divisible statute permitting review of the record of conviction.	83
4.3.B(2)	Record of conviction generally	84
4.3.B(3)	Specific record of conviction documents and issues	84
4.3.C	The circumstance-specific approach	85
4.3.C(1)	Certain aggravated felony category components.	86
4.3.C(2)	Controlled substance ground exception for single offense of possession of 30 grams or less of marijuana.	87
4.3.C(3)	Crime of domestic violence ground domestic relationship component.	87
4.4	Immigration Consequences of Accessory and Preparatory Offenses	87
4.4.A	Federal misprision of felony and possible state counterparts	87
4.4.B	Federal accessory after the fact and possible state counterparts.	88
4.4.C	Solicitation or facilitation.	89
4.4.D	Attempt	89
4.4.E	Conspiracy	90
4.4.F	Sentencing considerations	91

CHAPTER
5

STRATEGIES TO AVOID THE NEGATIVE IMMIGRATION CONSEQUENCES OF A NEW YORK CRIMINAL CASE

5.1	Preliminary Steps	101
5.2	To Disclose Or Not To Disclose Noncitizen Status	101
5.3	General Strategies In Criminal Proceedings	102
5.3.A	If your client is cooperating with law enforcement, or is a victim of certain crimes and assisting law enforcement, seek an informer or other special visa, or an agreement not to deport your client	102
5.3.A(1)	Obtain an “informer” or “S”-visa.	102
5.3.A(2)	Obtain a T-visa for trafficking victims.	102
5.3.A(3)	Obtain a U-visa for victims of other crimes.	103
5.3.A(4)	Obtain commitment by the federal government not to remove your client.	103
5.3.B	Move to dismiss case of a particularly sympathetic client in furtherance of justice (Clayton motion)	104
5.3.C	Move to remove case of a juvenile offender client to family court.	105

5.3.D	Obtain adjournment in contemplation of dismissal if possible	106
5.3.E	If your client wishes to plead guilty, negotiate a plea and sentence that does not make your client subject to removal from the United States or that at least does not make your client ineligible for relief from removal.	106
5.3.F	If your client is pleading guilty, avoid admissions of conduct beyond elements of offense	108
5.3.G	If your client is pleading guilty based on an understanding that conviction will not trigger negative immigration consequences, your client should so state when pleading	109
5.3.H	Move to withdraw an uninformed guilty plea prior to sentencing.	110
5.3.I	If your client does not wish to plead guilty after being informed of the immigration consequences of a plea deal, litigate legal issues and/or go to trial even where you might not have ordinarily done so	110
5.3.J	Make sure your client receives youthful offender treatment if your client is eligible.	111
5.3.K	Seek a certificate of relief from civil disabilities from the sentencing judge if your client is eligible.	111
5.3.L	File a notice of appeal	112
5.3.M	Seek post-judgment relief	112
5.3.N	Seek a pardon from the governor	113
5.4	Specific Strategies: Drug Charge	113
5.5	Specific Strategies: Violent Offense Charge (Including Murder, Rape or Other Sex Offense, Assault, Criminal Mischief, and Robbery)	117
5.6	Specific Strategies: Property Offense Charge (Including Theft, Burglary, Or Fraud Offense)	120
5.7	Specific Strategies: Firearm Charge	123
5.8	Strategies and Resources Regarding Immigration Detainers/Holds	125
5.9	Strategies And Resources In Later Removal Proceedings	126